

AAEE

Resource adequacy with increasing shares of wind and solar power: a comparison of European and U.S. electricity market designs

Hans Auer

Austrian Association for Energy Economics Energy Economics Group (EEG) Technische Universität Wien auer@eeg.tuwien.ac.at

Audun Botterud

Laboratory for Information and Decision Systems Massachusetts Institute of Technology audunb@mit.edu

42nd IAEE International Conference: Local Energy, Global Markets Montreal May 29 - June 1, 2019



- 1. What are the pros and cons of the key electricity market design characteristics in Europe and the U.S. for hosting high shares of variable wind and solar PV generation?
- 2. What is the impact of variable wind and solar PV generation on electricity market prices in the short- and long-term?
- 3. Is the consideration of capacity mechanism justified to address resource adequacy challenges?
- 4. What are the electricity market design options for resource adequacy exploiting several flexibility potentials and demand side participation? Good practice examples?



Data Sources: Data Source: ABB Velocity Suite and U.S. EIA

Sources: EEG-EEMD (2017) and BAFA (2017)

In addition, we frequently have been observing negative electricity market prices in recent years, both Europe and the U.S.



Renewable Support Schemes in Europe & U.S.





Data Source: DSIRE (2017)

In addition, <u>indirect enablers</u> (e.g. net metering, solar PV sharing in communities, microgrids) and <u>voluntary schemes</u> (e.g. corporate renewable deals, community choice aggregation programs), both Europe and the U.S.

Capacity Mechanisms - Current Status in Europe & U.S. AAEE



Source: EEG-EEMD (2017)

WIEN

Source: IRC – ISO/RTO Council (www.isorto.org); own research







- Energy-only Market
 - Prices in energy (and reserves) markets provide investment incentives
 - Importance of scarcity rents (higher offer prices above marginal cost during scarcity situations (to cover the average cost in the longer-term)
 - Exploitation of several existing flexibilities in the electricity system
- Example: Price Sensitive Load Response



Capacity Subscription - Inclusion of Demand Side in CM AAEE

The idea (Doorman 2005)

- Consumers buy the capacity they need under system scarcity
- Generators (and storage) receive capacity payments accordingly
- System operator limits consumer demand during scarcity
- A practical implementation of a "priority service" (Chao and Wilson 1987)

Several advantages (Doorman and De Vries 2017)

- Consumers pay directly for the scarce resource: generation capacity
- Capacity adequacy moves in the direction of a private good (economically efficient rationing)
- Capacity price and quantity reflecting consumer preferences
- Reduced risk for consumers and producers

Challenges

Cost of controlling loads at consumer level
 (load limiting devices)



Comparison: Short-term Electricity Market Operations AAEE

Europe

Indroduced new power exchanges (PXs)

- Include long-term contracts
- TSOs typically own transmission system
- Emphasize markets and economics

Short-term market operations

- Day-ahead and intraday markets (PX)
- Real-time balancing markets (TSO)
- Simple bids/generator UC
- Zonal pricing/market coupling
- Sequential reserve and energy markets
- <u>Market-based decentralised balancing</u>
 <u>through balance responsible parties</u>

Variable renewable energy

- Strong policy support
- Feed-in tariffs/premiums, tenders/auctions
- VRE as "must-take"

Retail competition

Retail choice in all countries

U.S.

Build into existing system operators (ISOs)

- Short-term system operation
- ISOs do not own transmission system
- Emphasize physics of the power system

Short-term market operations

- Day-ahead market (ISO hourly)
- Real-time market (ISO 5 min)
- Complex bids/ISO UC
- Locational marginal prices
- Co-optimization of energy and operating reserves
- More centralized control through ISO

Variable renewable energy

- Intermittent policy support
- Tax credits, renewable portfolio standards
- "Dispatchable" VRE

Retail competition

Retail choice in some states

U.S._{Good Practice}: Locational Marg. Prices & Congestion Mgmt. AAEE



WIEN

10

Europe_{Good Practice}: Renewable Energy Communities

Creating added value for local producers, prosumers and consumers...

...at multi-apartment building level

...at wider local energy community level



Source: Fleischhacker et al (2018)



<u>Business Case:</u> "Peer-to-Peer" Renewable Energy Matching in UK (Good Energy) <u>EU-Project BestRES</u>: 13 Business Models for Renewable Energy Aggregators



Source: www.bestres.eu

(Selection of) Recommendations for Improved Market Design AAEE

- Getting the price formation in short-term energy/reserve markets is the key challenge, notably during scarcity conditions.
- Removal of barriers for supply, demand and energy storage technologies at several levels to enable participation in several market segments equally in terms of energy, capacity and ancillary services provision.
- Exploitation of several system flexibility options, notably those for distributed/local generation and demand response.
- Avoidance of further market distortions (capacity mechanisms), but rather removal of technology specific subsidy schemes for variable renewable generation
- Adequate pricing of carbon and other environmental externalities in a more market-compatible manner is essential.

No single solution: lessons to be learned in both directions, Europe <-> U.S.!



Collaborators

- Audun Botterud
- Andreas Fleischhacker
- Daniel Schwabeneder
- Lukas Wachter
- Georg Lettner

Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) Technische Universität Wien (TU Wien) Technische Universität Wien (TU Wien) Technische Universität Wien (TU Wien) Technische Universität Wien (TU Wien)

References

- Botterud A., H. Auer, "Resource Adequacy with Increasing Shares of Wind and Solar Power: A Comparison of European and U.S. Electricity Market Designs", *Economics of Energy and Environmental Policy*, forthcoming 2019.
- Botterud A., H. Auer, "Resource Adequacy with Increasing Shares of Wind and Solar Power: A Comparison of European and U.S. Electricity Market Designs," *Joint Working Paper MIT/EEG*, http://ceepr.mit.edu/files/papers/2018-008.pdf, 2018.
- Fleischhacker A., H. AUER, A. BOTTERUD: "Sharing solar PV and energy storage in apartment buildings: resource allocation and pricing", *IEEE Transactions on Smart Grid*, 2018, DOI: 10.1109/TSG.2018.2844877
- Wiser R., Mills A.D., Seel J., Levin T., Botterud A., "Impacts of Variable Renewable Energy on Bulk Power System Assets, Pricing, and Costs", *Technical Report LBNL-2001082*, 2017.
- EU-Project BestRES, www.bestres.eu